



TAMI RITTER, CHAIR
Supervisor, District #3

ADDISON WINSLOW, VICE CHAIR
Councilmember, Chico

BILL CONNELLY
Supervisor, District #1

PETER DURFEE
Supervisor, District #2

TOD KIMMELSHUE
Supervisor, District #4

DOUG TEETER
Supervisor, District #5

CHUCK NUCHOLS
Vice Mayor, Biggs

ANGEL CALDERON
Councilmember, Gridley

ERIC SMITH
Vice Mayor, Oroville

ROSE TRYON
Councilmember, Paradise

STEPHEN ERTLIE
Air Pollution Control Officer

PATRICK LUCEY
Assistant Air Pollution Control Officer

Final Minutes of the Butte County Air Quality Management District Governing Board of Directors Meeting of June 27, 2024

Members Present:

Tami Ritter	Supervisor, District 3
Bill Connelly	Supervisor, District 1
Tod Kimmelshue	Supervisor, District 4
Eric Smith	Vice Mayor, City of Oroville
Addison Winslow	Councilmember, Chico
Ron Lassonde	Mayor, Town of Paradise (alternate)

Members Absent:

Peter Durfee	Supervisor, District 2
Doug Teeter	Supervisor, District 5
Angel Calderon	Councilmember, Gridley
Chuck Nuchols	Vice Mayor, Biggs
Rose Tryon	Councilmember, Town of Paradise

Staff Present:

Stephen Ertlie	Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO)
Kelly Towne	Clerk of the Board
Aleah Ing	Administrative Services Officer (ASO)

Remote Staff:

Jason Mandly	Senior Air Quality Planner
David Campbell	Air Quality Compliance Specialist II
Samuel Nassie	Air Quality Compliance Specialist II
Laurie LaGrone	Administrative Technician
Seth Tate	

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

Chair Ritter called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m. at the BCAG Board Room, 326 Huss Drive, Suite 100, Chico, California.

2. Additions and Deletions to the Consent or Regular Agenda.

No additions or deletions.

3. Consent Agenda.

- 3.1** Minutes of the May 23, 2024 Meeting of the Board of Directors.
- 3.2** Activity Report on Butte County Air Quality Management District Activities.
- 3.3** Financial Status Report Fiscal Year 2023-2024.
- 3.4** Status Report on Calendar of Events.
- 3.5** Status Report on Communications.

ACTION REQUESTED: Approve Consent Agenda Items.

Board comments: None.

Public comments: None.

A motion was made by Supervisor Kimmelshue and seconded by Mayor Lassonde to approve the Consent Agenda Items.

Motion carries by the following vote:

AYES: Supervisor Ritter, Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Kimmelshue (motion), Councilmember Winslow, Vice Mayor Smith and Mayor Lassonde (second).

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Durfee, Supervisor Teeter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Calderon, and Councilmember Tryon.

ITEMS FOR ACTION

4. Items removed from the Consent Agenda for Board consideration and actions.

No items removed from the Consent Agenda.

5. Public Hearing for Adoption of Proposed Fiscal Year 2024-2025 Budget.

ACTION REQUESTED:

- 1. Following a Public Hearing on the Fiscal Year 2024-2025 Budget, accept comments and,
- 2. Amend the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 Budget to the Final Projected Budget and,
- 3. Add additional Revenue account to separate Technical Evaluation Fees from Misc Income,
- 4. Adopt implementing Resolution 2024-06 Adopting the Final Fiscal Year 2024-2025 Budget and,
- 5. Adopt implementing Resolution 2024-07 Authorizing Contracted Legal Services.

The Proposed Fiscal Year 2024-2025 Budget report was presented by Aleah Ing, Administrative Services Officer.

Board Discussion: None.

Public comments: None.

Public Hearing Closed: 10:05 a.m.

A motion was made by Supervisor Kimmelshue and seconded by Vice Mayor Smith to approve the Fiscal Year 2024-2025 Budget, Resolution 2024-06 and Resolution 2024-07.

Motion carries by the following vote:

AYES: Supervisor Ritter, Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Kimmelshue (motion), Councilmember Winslow, Vice Mayor Smith (second) and Mayor Lassonde.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Durfee, Supervisor Teeter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Calderon, and Councilmember Tryon.

6. Permit to Operate Program Cost Recovery Analysis & Request for Fee Increase Direction.

ACTION REQUESTED: Review cost recovery deficit and provide direction for fee rule amendments.

The Permit to Operate Program Cost Recovery Analysis & Request for Fee Increase Direction report was presented by Stephen Ertle, Air Pollution Control Officer.

Board discussion: Board discussion ensued.

Public comments: None.

A motion was made by Supervisor Connelly and seconded by Supervisor Kimmelshue to select option #4 for direction for fee rule amendments which adds a phased in variable cost recovery fee based on existing permit renewal fee hourly factor beginning in 2025 and thereafter.

Permit Renewal Hourly Factor	Cost Recovery X in 2025	Cost Recovery X in 2026	Cost Recovery X in 2027
0-4	1.5	2	2
5-9	2.5	3.5	4
10-19	3.5	5	6
20 or above	5.5	8	10

Motion carries by the following vote:

AYES: Supervisor Ritter, Supervisor Connelly (motion), Supervisor Kimmelshue (second), Councilmember Winslow, Vice Mayor Smith and Mayor Lassonde.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Durfee, Supervisor Teeter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Calderon, and Councilmember Tryon.

7. Community Air Protection (CAP) Policies and Procedures Update.

ACTION REQUESTED: Approve Resolution 2024-08 approving updates to the District's CAP Incentives Policies and Procedure Manual.

The Community Air Protection (CAP) Policies and Procedures Update was presented by Jason Mandly, Senior Air Quality Planner.

Board discussion: Board Discussion ensued.

Public comments: None.

A motion was made by Supervisor Connelly and seconded by Councilmember Winslow to Approve Resolution #2024-08 approving updates to the District's CAP Incentives Policies and Procedure Manual.

Motion carries by the following vote:

AYES: Supervisor Ritter, Supervisor Connelly (motion), Supervisor Kimmelshue, Councilmember Winslow (second), Vice Mayor Smith and Mayor Lassonde.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Durfee, Supervisor Teeter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Calderon, and Councilmember Tryon.

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

8. APCO Report.

ACTION REQUESTED: None. This item is provided for information and discussion.

See Addendum to the minutes for the report.

Board Discussion: Board Discussion ensued.

Public Comment: None.

9. Other Business.

None.

10. Public Comment Period. Any person may address the Board of Directors on any matter within the jurisdiction of the Board that is not on the agenda for this meeting. Any person may address the Board on an agenda item when that time is called. The Chair requests that each person addressing the Board limits their presentation to five (5) minutes.

11. Adjourn to Closed Session. The meeting went to closed session at 10:57 a.m.

12. Report From Closed Session.


- APCO given direction from the Governing Board for labor negotiations.

13. The meeting adjourned at 11:10 a.m. The next Board of Directors Meeting is scheduled for June 27, 2024 at 10:00 a.m. at the Butte County Association of Governments Board Room, 326 Huss Drive, Suite 100, Chico, California.



Stephen Ertle, Air Pollution Control Officer
Butte County Air Quality Management District

I hereby attest that this is a true and correct copy of the action taken by the Butte County Air Quality Management District Board of Directors on June 27, 2024.

ATTEST: 
Kelly Towne, Clerk of the Governing Board

Attachment 1 APCO Report

Federal

- EPA Changes last August removed the allowance of Emergency Provisions in Title V Permits go into effect August 21st. This will require a rule change (Rule 1101-Title V Federal Operating Permits) to remove those provisions. Staff are filing an extension request of one year to allow time to conduct the Rule revisions.
- Last week Staff met with CARB regarding new PM2.5 standard. We are at 8.9 micrograms (standard is 9). 2024 measurements will be critical.

State

- Final Budget in Print 6/22-FARMER not funded. Expect Governor's signature today or tomorrow.
- The RX Fire Grant was increased to 3million/year. Our annual award will increase slightly.
- Initiative 1935 Taxpayer Protection and Government Accountability Act Legislature v. Weber, a unanimous California Supreme Court ordered Secretary of State Shirley Weber not to place Initiative 1935 on the November 2024 statewide ballot because, rather than a lawful initiative amendment of the California Constitution, it is an improper revision. A revision can only be proposed by the Legislature or a constitutional convention.
- CAPCOA Tracking 14 High Priority Bills.

Local

- BCC held an emergency meeting June 21st to consider approving a letter requesting that an Agricultural Biomass to Bioenergy Initiative be funded out of November's Climate Bond.
- Butte County received a BDO Zone Rating of BBB earlier this month. This confirms at least 223,000 bone dry tons/year of woody biomass material within a 75-mile radius.
- OroCarbo (Brian Wong) founder. Expects to open in 2026:
 - Biomass from local orchards, to produce renewable diesel, hydrogen, graphite and graphene with zero waste.
 - Operating at full capacity the plant will process 500 wet tons of biomass per day generating 32,000 gallons of renewable diesel and 42 tons of biochar, a charcoal-like substance used to improve soil health.

CAPCOA

- Held Spring Conference in May
 - Diesel ICE Risk Guidance review/comment.
 - ED working with CARB on CEC air permitting.
 - With new PM standard EE will be more important than ever: Planning an Exceptional E demo for fall membership meeting.
 - 2025 CAPCOA 50th anniversary: committee was formed to develop ideas and present to board in August.